Tensor Models at N Large and Small

Igor Klebanov



Talk at Strings 2018, Okinawa Institute of Science and Technology June 27, 2018

Three Large N Limits

- O(N) Vector: solvable because the bubble diagrams can be summed.
- Matrix ('t Hooft) Limit: planar diagrams.
 Solvable only in special cases.
- Tensor of rank three and higher. When interactions are specially chosen, dominated by the melonic (ladder) diagrams. Bonzom, Gurau, Riello, Rivasseau; Carrozza, Tanasa; Witten; IK, Tarnopolsky



O(N) x O(N) Matrix Model

- Theory of real matrices φ^{ab} with distinguishable indices, i.e. in the bi-fundamental representation of O(N)_axO(N)_b symmetry.
- The interaction is at least quartic: g tr $\varphi \varphi^{\mathsf{T}} \varphi \varphi^{\mathsf{T}}$
- Propagators are represented by colored double lines, and the interaction vertex is
- In d=0 or 1 special limits describe twodimensional quantum gravity.

- In the large N limit where gN is held fixed we find planar Feynman graphs, and each index loop may be red or green.
- The dual graphs shown in black may be thought of as random surfaces tiled with squares whose vertices have alternating colors (red, green, red, green).



From Bi- to Tri-Fundamentals

For a 3-tensor with distinguishable indices the propagator has index structure

$$\langle \phi^{abc} \phi^{a'b'c'} \rangle = \delta^{aa'} \delta^{bb'} \delta^{cc'}$$

- It may be represented graphically by 3 colored wires ^a/_b
- Tetrahedral interaction with O(N)_axO(N)_bxO(N)_c symmetry Carrozza, Tanasa; IK, Tarnopolsky

$$\frac{1}{4}g\phi^{a_1b_1c_1}\phi^{a_1b_2c_2}\phi^{a_2b_1c_2}\phi^{a_2b_2c_1}$$



Leading correction to the propagator has 3 index loops



- Requiring that this "melon" insertion is of order 1 means that $\lambda = g N^{3/2}$ must be held fixed in the large N limit.
- Melonic graphs obtained by iterating



Cables and Wires

• The Feynman graphs of the quartic field theory may be resolved in terms of the colored wires (triple lines) $\lambda = q N^{3/2}$



Non-Melonic Graphs

• Most Feynman graphs in the quartic field theory are not melonic are therefore subdominant in the new large N limit, e.g.



- Scales as $g^3 N^6 \sim N^3 \lambda^3 N^{-3/2}$
- None of the graphs with an odd number of vertices are melonic.

The Sachdev-Ye-Kitaev Model

• Quantum mechanics of a large number N_{SYK} of anti-commuting variables with action

$$I = \int \mathrm{d}t \left(\frac{\mathrm{i}}{2} \sum_{i} \psi_{i} \frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}t} \psi_{i} - \mathrm{i}^{q/2} j_{i_{1}i_{2}\dots i_{q}} \psi_{i_{1}} \psi_{i_{2}} \dots \psi_{i_{q}} \right)$$

 Random couplings j have a Gaussian distribution with zero mean.

. . .

• The model flows to strong coupling and becomes nearly conformal. Georges, Parcollet, Sachdev; Kitaev; Polchinski, Rosenhaus; Maldacena, Stanford; Jevicki, Suzuki, Yoon;

- Spectrum for a single realization of N_{SYK}=32 model with q=4. Maldacena, Stanford
- No exact degeneracies, but the gaps are exponentially small. Large low T entropy.



SYK-Like Tensor Quantum Mechanics

- E. Witten, "An SYK-Like Model Without Disorder," arXiv: 1610.09758. Has 4N³ fermions.
- Appeared on the evening of Halloween: October 31, 2016.



 It is sometimes tempting to change the term "melon diagrams" to "pumpkin diagrams."

The O(N)³ Model

• A pruned version: there are N³ Majorana fermions IK, Tarnopolsky

$$\{\psi^{abc},\psi^{a'b'c'}\} = \delta^{aa'}\delta^{bb'}\delta^{cc'}$$
$$H = \frac{g}{4}\psi^{abc}\psi^{abc'}\psi^{a'bc'}\psi^{a'bc'}\psi^{a'b'c} - \frac{g}{16}N^4$$

- Has $O(N)_a x O(N)_b x O(N)_c$ symmetry under $\psi^{abc} \rightarrow M_1^{aa'} M_2^{bb'} M_3^{cc'} \psi^{a'b'c'}, \quad M_1, M_2, M_3 \in O(N)$
- The SO(N) symmetry charges are

$$Q_1^{aa'} = \frac{i}{2} [\psi^{abc}, \psi^{a'bc}] , \qquad Q_2^{bb'} = \frac{i}{2} [\psi^{abc}, \psi^{ab'c}] , \qquad Q_3^{cc'} = \frac{i}{2} [\psi^{abc}, \psi^{abc'}]$$

 The 3-tensors may be associated with indistinguishable vertices of a tetrahedron.

• This is equivalent to

 The 3-line Feynman graphs are produced using the propagator



Schwinger-Dyson Equations

• Some are the same as in the SYK model Kitaev,;

Polchinski, Rosenhaus; Maldacena, Stanford; Jevicki, Suzuki, Yoon



• Neglecting the left-hand side in IR we find

$$G(t_1 - t_2) = -\left(\frac{1}{4\pi g^2 N^3}\right)^{1/4} \frac{\operatorname{sgn}(t_1 - t_2)}{|t_1 - t_2|^{1/2}}$$

• Four point function

 $\langle \psi^{a_1b_1c_1}(t_1)\psi^{a_1b_1c_1}(t_2)\psi^{a_2b_2c_2}(t_3)\psi^{a_2b_2c_2}(t_4)\rangle = N^6G(t_{12})G(t_{34}) + \Gamma(t_1,\ldots,t_4)$



• If we denote by Γ_n the ladder with n rungs

$$\Gamma = \sum_{n} \Gamma_{n}$$

$$\Gamma_{n+1}(t_1, \dots, t_4) = \int dt dt' K(t_1, t_2; t, t') \Gamma_n(t, t', t_3, t_4)$$

$$K(t_1, t_2; t_3, t_4) = -3g^2 N^3 G(t_{13}) G(t_{24}) G(t_{34})^2$$

Spectrum of two-particle operators

• S-D equation for the three-point function Gross, Rosenhaus



• Scaling dimensions of operators $O_2^n = \psi^{abc} (D_t^n \psi)^{abc}$

$$g(h) = -\frac{3}{2} \frac{\tan(\frac{\pi}{2}(h - \frac{1}{2}))}{h - 1/2} = 1$$

• The first solution is h=2; dual to gravity.



• The higher scaling dimensions are $h \approx 3.77, 5.68, 7.63, 9.60$ approaching $h_n \rightarrow n + \frac{1}{2}$

Gauge Invariant Operators

• Bilinear operators related by the EOM to some of the higher particle "single-sum" operators.

Otetra O⁽¹⁾_{pillow}
 All the 6-particle
 operators vanish by
 the Fermi statistics in
 the theory of one
 Majorana tensor

 a_2



• The bubbles come from O(N) charges and vanish in the gauged model:



 The 17 single-sum 8-particle operators which do not include bubble insertions are



Factorial Growth

- There are 24 bubble-free 10-particle; 617 12particle; 4887 14-particle; 82466 16-particle operators; etc.
- The number of (2k)-particle operators grows asymptotically as k! 2^k. Bulycheva, IK, Milekhin, Tarnopolsky
- The Hagedorn temperature of the large N theory vanishes as 1/log N.
- The tensor models seem to lie "beyond string theory."
- Are they related to M-theory?

Spectra of Energy Eigenstates

- Generalize the Majorana tensor model to have $O(N_1) \times O(N_2) \times O(N_3)$ symmetry
- The traceless Hamiltonian is

 $H = \frac{g}{4} \psi^{abc} \psi^{abc'} \psi^{a'bc'} \psi^{a'b'c} - \frac{g}{16} N_1 N_2 N_3 (N_1 - N_2 + N_3)$ $\{\psi^{abc}, \psi^{a'b'c'}\} = \delta^{aa'} \delta^{bb'} \delta^{cc'}$ $a = 1, \dots, N_1; \ b = 1, \dots, N_2; \ c = 1, \dots, N_3$

- The Hilbert space has dimension $2^{[N_1N_2N_3/2]}$
- Eigenstates of H form irreducible representations of the symmetry.

Complete Diagonalizations

• Generally possible only for small ranks. Krishnan,

Pavan Kumar, Sanyal, Bala Subramanian, Rosa; Chaudhuri et al.; IK, Roberts, Stanford, Tarnopolsky

• For example IK, Milekhin, Popov, Tarnopolsky



Figure 1: Spectrum of the $O(4)^2 \times O(2)$ model. There are four singlet states, and the stars mark their energies. $\pm 16q$ and $\pm 4q$

(N_1, N_2)	(2,2)	(2,3)	(3,3)	(2,4)	(3,4)	(4,4)
$\frac{4}{a}E_{\text{degeneracy}}$	-81	-13 ₂	-20 ₆	-24 ₁	-34 ₆	-641
5	0_{14}	-76	-16_{18}	-16_{2}	-28_{24}	-48_{55}
	81	-3 ₂	-12_{16}	-12_{16}	-24_8	-40_{106}
		-1_{22}	-8 ₆₀	-8_{23}	-22_{76}	-36_{256}
		1_{22}	-4 ₄₂	-4_{16}	-20_{40}	-32_{810}
		3_{2}	0_{228}	0_{140}	-18 ₁₄	-28_{256}
		7_6	4_{42}	4_{16}	-16_{152}	-24_{3250}
		13_{2}	8 ₆₀	8 ₂₃	-14_{168}	-20_{1024}
			12_{16}	12_{16}	-12_{40}	-16_{4985}
			16_{18}	16_{2}	-10_{170}	-12_{3072}
			20_{6}	24_{1}	-8_{240}	-8_{8932}
					-6_{194}	-4_{3584}
					-4_{384}	0_{12874}
					-2_{270}	4_{3584}
					0_{248}	8_{8932}
					2_{640}	12_{3072}
					4_{384}	16_{4985}
					6_{76}	20_{1024}
					8_{312}	24_{3250}
					10_{216}	28_{256}
					14_{32}	32_{810}
					16_{128}	36_{256}
					18_{168}	40_{106}
					20_{64}	48_{55}
					26_{10}	64_1
					28_{24}	
					30_{6}	
					38_{2}	

- Spectra for N₃=2
- For the O(2)³ model only two singlets at energies -2g and 2g.

Energy Bounds

• The bound on the singlet ground state energy IK, Milekhin, Popov, Tarnopolsky

$$|E| \le E_{bound} = \frac{g}{16} N^3 (N+2) \sqrt{N-1}$$

- In the melonic limit, this correctly scales as N³.
- The gap to the lowest non-singlet state scales as 1/N.
- For unequal ranks the bound is

$$|E| \le \frac{g}{16} N_1 N_2 N_3 (N_1 N_2 N_3 + N_1^2 + N_2^2 + N_3^2 - 4)^{1/2}$$

A Fermionic Matrix Model

• For $N_3 = 2$ the bound simplifies to

$$|E|_{N_3=2} \le \frac{g}{8} N_1 N_2 (N_1 + N_2)$$

- Saturated by the ground state.
- This is a fermionic matrix model with symmetry $O(N_1) \times O(N_2) \times U(1)$ $\bar{\psi}_{ab} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\psi^{ab1} + i\psi^{ab2} \right), \quad \psi_{ab} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left(\psi^{ab1} - i\psi^{ab2} \right)$ $\{\bar{\psi}_{ab}, \bar{\psi}_{a'b'}\} = \{\psi_{ab}, \psi_{a'b'}\} = 0, \quad \{\bar{\psi}_{ab}, \psi_{a'b'}\} = \delta_{aa'}\delta_{bb'}$

Gauge Singlets

- To eliminate large degeneracies, focus on the states invariant under $SO(N_1) \times SO(N_2) \times SO(N_3)$
- Their number can be found by gauging the free theory $L = \psi^{I} \partial_{t} \psi^{I} + \psi^{I} A_{IJ} \psi^{J}$

$$A = A^{1} \otimes \mathbb{1} \otimes \mathbb{1} + \mathbb{1} \otimes A^{2} \otimes \mathbb{1} + \mathbb{1} \otimes \mathbb{1} \otimes A^{3}$$

#singlet states =
$$\int d\lambda_{G}^{N} \prod_{a=1}^{M/2} 2\cos(\lambda_{a}/2)$$
$$d\lambda_{SO(2n)} = \prod_{i < j}^{n} \sin\left(\frac{x_{i} - x_{j}}{2}\right)^{2} \sin\left(\frac{x_{i} + x_{j}}{2}\right)^{2} dx_{1} \dots dx_{n}$$

Singlets in the Matrix Model

• Their number grows slowly. For $N_1 = N_2 = 10$ only 24 singlets out of 2^{100} states.

singlet states
4
4
4
6
8
18
6
8
20
24

Table 3: Number of singlet states in the $O(N_1) \times O(N_2) \times O(2)$ model

Gauge Singlets in the O(N)³ Model

- Their number vanishes for odd N due to a QM anomaly for odd numbers of flavors.
- Grows very rapidly for even N

 $\begin{array}{c|cc}
N & \# \text{ singlet states} \\
\hline
2 & 2 \\
4 & 36 \\
6 & 595354780
\end{array}$

Table 1: Number of singlet states in the $O(N)^3$ model

#singlet states ~ exp
$$\left(\frac{N^3}{2}\log 2 - \frac{3N^2}{2}\log N + O(N^2)\right)$$

• The large low-temperature entropy suggests tiny gaps for singlet excitations ~ c^{-N^3}

Spectrum of the Gauged N=4 Model

- Work in progress on this system of 32 qubits with K. Pakrouski, F. Popov and G. Tarnopolsky.
- Need to isolate the 36 states invariant under SO(4)³ out of the 601080390 "half-filled" states (those with 16 ones and 16 zeros).
- Diagonalize 4H/g + 100 C where C is the sum of three Casimir operators.
- A Lanczos type algorithm is well suited for this sparse operator.
- Find 15 distinct SO(4)³ invariant energy levels:
 E=0 and 7 "mirror pairs" (E, -E).

Discrete Symmetries

- Act within the SO(N)³ invariant sector and can lead to small degeneracies.
- Z₂ parity transformation within each group like $\psi^{1bc} \rightarrow -\psi^{1bc}$
- Interchanges of the groups flip the energy

$$P_{23}\psi^{abc}P_{23} = \psi^{acb} , \qquad P_{12}\psi^{abc}P_{12} = \psi^{bac}$$

 $P_{23}HP_{23} = -H , \qquad P_{12}HP_{12} = -H$

• Z_3 symmetry generated by $P = P_{12}P_{23}$, $P^3 = 1$ $P\psi^{abc}P^{\dagger} = \psi^{cab}$, $PHP^{\dagger} = H$

Preliminary Numerical Results

- The maximum degeneracy at non-zero energy is 3.
- The lowest singlet state is non-degenerate and has
 E₀=- 40.035 g.
- This is likely the ground state of H.
- It is not far from our lower bound -41.569 g
- The next SO(4)³ invariant states are at -24.255 g; they have degeneracy 3.
- The highest degeneracy is at E=0.

Unstable Bosonic Tensor Model

• Action with a potential that is not positive definite IK, Tarnopolsky; Giombi, IK, Tarnopolsky

$$S = \int d^d x \left(\frac{1}{2} \partial_\mu \phi^{abc} \partial^\mu \phi^{abc} + \frac{1}{4} g \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_1 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_1} \right)$$

• Schwinger-Dyson equation for 2pt function Patashinsky, Pokrovsky

$$G^{-1}(p) = -\lambda^2 \int \frac{d^d k d^d q}{(2\pi)^{2d}} G(q) G(k) G(p+q+k)$$

Has solution

$$G(p) = \lambda^{-1/2} \left(\frac{(4\pi)^d d\Gamma(\frac{3d}{4})}{4\Gamma(1-\frac{d}{4})} \right)^{1/4} \frac{1}{(p^2)^{\frac{d}{4}}}$$

Spectrum of two-particle spin zero operators

• Schwinger-Dyson equation

$$\int d^{d}x_{3}d^{d}x_{4}K(x_{1}, x_{2}; x_{3}, x_{4})v_{h}(x_{3}, x_{4}) = g(h)v_{h}(x_{1}, x_{2})$$

$$K(x_{1}, x_{2}; x_{3}, x_{4}) = 3\lambda^{2}G(x_{13})G(x_{24})G(x_{34})^{2}$$

$$v_{h}(x_{1}, x_{2}) = \frac{1}{[(x_{1} - x_{2})^{2}]^{\frac{1}{2}(\frac{d}{2} - h)}}$$

$$g_{\text{bos}}(h) = -\frac{3\Gamma\left(\frac{3d}{4}\right)\Gamma\left(\frac{d}{4} - \frac{h}{2}\right)\Gamma\left(\frac{h}{2} - \frac{d}{4}\right)}{\Gamma\left(-\frac{d}{4}\right)\Gamma\left(\frac{3d}{4} - \frac{h}{2}\right)\Gamma\left(\frac{d}{4} + \frac{h}{2}\right)}$$

• In d<4 the first solution is complex $\frac{d}{2} + i\alpha(d)$

Complex Fixed Point in 4-E Dimensions

• The tetrahedron operator

 $O_t(x) = \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_1 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_1}$

mixes with the pillow and double-sum operators

$$O_p(x) = \frac{1}{3} \left(\phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_1} + \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_2 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_1 b_2 c_2} + \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_2 c_1} \phi^{a_2 b_1 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_2} \right),$$

$$O_{ds}(x) = \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_2 c_2}$$

• The renormalizable action is

$$S = \int d^d x \left(\frac{1}{2} \partial_\mu \phi^{abc} \partial^\mu \phi^{abc} + \frac{1}{4} \left(g_1 O_t(x) + g_2 O_p(x) + g_3 O_{ds}(x) \right) \right)$$

• The large N scaling is

$$g_1 = \frac{(4\pi)^2 \tilde{g}_1}{N^{3/2}}, \quad g_2 = \frac{(4\pi)^2 \tilde{g}_2}{N^2}, \quad g_3 = \frac{(4\pi)^2 \tilde{g}_3}{N^3}$$

• The 2-loop beta functions and fixed points:

$$\begin{split} \tilde{\beta}_t &= -\epsilon \tilde{g}_1 + 2\tilde{g}_1^3 \,, \\ \tilde{\beta}_p &= -\epsilon \tilde{g}_2 + \left(6\tilde{g}_1^2 + \frac{2}{3}\tilde{g}_2^2\right) - 2\tilde{g}_1^2\tilde{g}_2 \,, \\ \tilde{\beta}_{ds} &= -\epsilon \tilde{g}_3 + \left(\frac{4}{3}\tilde{g}_2^2 + 4\tilde{g}_2\tilde{g}_3 + 2\tilde{g}_3^2\right) - 2\tilde{g}_1^2(4\tilde{g}_2 + 5\tilde{g}_3) \end{split}$$

 $\tilde{g}_1^* = (\epsilon/2)^{1/2}, \quad \tilde{g}_2^* = \pm 3i(\epsilon/2)^{1/2}, \quad \tilde{g}_3^* = \mp i(3\pm\sqrt{3})(\epsilon/2)^{1/2}$

• The scaling dimension of $\phi^{abc}\phi^{abc}$ is

$$\Delta_O = d - 2 + 2(\tilde{g}_2^* + \tilde{g}_3^*) = 2 \pm i\sqrt{6\epsilon} + \mathcal{O}(\epsilon)$$

Stable Bosonic Model in 2.9 Dimensions

 Work in progress with S. Giombi, F. Popov, S. Prakash and G. Tarnopolsky on the theory dominated by the positive "prism" interaction

$$S = \int d^d x \left(\frac{1}{2} (\partial_\mu \phi^{abc})^2 + \frac{g_1}{6!} \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_1 c_2} \phi^{a_3 b_3 c_1} \phi^{a_3 b_2 c_3} \phi^{a_2 b_3 c_3} \right)$$

 To obtain the large N solution it is convenient to rewrite

$$S = \int d^d x \left(\frac{1}{2} (\partial_\mu \phi^{abc})^2 + \frac{\lambda}{3!} \phi^{a_1 b_1 c_1} \phi^{a_1 b_2 c_2} \phi^{a_2 b_1 c_2} \chi^{a_2 b_2 c_1} - \frac{1}{2} \chi^{abc} \chi^{abc} \right)$$

• Tensor counterpart of a bosonic SYK-like model.

Murugan, Stanford, Witten

• The IR solution in general dimension:

$$\begin{split} & 3\Delta_{\phi} + \Delta_{\chi} = d \ , \qquad d/2 - 1 < \Delta_{\phi} < d/6 \\ & \frac{\Gamma(\Delta_{\phi})\Gamma(d - \Delta_{\phi})}{\Gamma(\frac{d}{2} - \Delta_{\phi})\Gamma(-\frac{d}{2} + \Delta_{\phi})} = 3\frac{\Gamma(3\Delta_{\phi})\Gamma(d - 3\Delta_{\phi})}{\Gamma(\frac{d}{2} - 3\Delta_{\phi})\Gamma(-\frac{d}{2} + 3\Delta_{\phi})} \end{split}$$

• In $d = 3 - \epsilon$

 $\Delta_{\phi} = \frac{1}{2} - \frac{\epsilon}{2} + \epsilon^2 - \frac{20\epsilon^3}{3} + \left(\frac{472}{9} + \frac{\pi^2}{3}\right)\epsilon^4 + \left(7\zeta(3) - \frac{12692}{27} - \frac{56\pi^2}{9}\right)\epsilon^5 + O\left(\epsilon^6\right)$

• For d=2.9 find numerically

 $\Delta_{\phi} = 0.456264 , \qquad \Delta_{\chi} = 1.53121$

Graphical solution for dimensions of bilinear operators in d=2.9



• The first root is

$$\Delta_{\phi^2} = 1 - \epsilon + 32\epsilon^2 - \frac{976\epsilon^3}{3} + \left(\frac{30320}{9} + \frac{32\pi^2}{3}\right)\epsilon^4 + O\left(\epsilon^5\right)$$

• For d<2.8056, Δ_{ϕ^2} becomes complex.

Renormalized Perturbation Theory

- For 2.8056 < d <3 the large N theory is stable.
- To make the theory renormalizable in d=3 need to add 7 more O(N)³ invariant terms.
- The 8 coupled beta functions have a nontrivial real fixed point.
- The resulting epsilon expansions agree in the large N limit with the solutions of the Schwinger-Dyson equations.

Conclusions

- The vector and matrix large N limits have been used extensively for many years in various theoretical physics problems.
- The tensor large N limits for rank 3 and higher are relatively new.
- The O(N)³ fermionic tensor quantum mechanics seems to be the closest counterpart of the basic SYK model for Majorana fermions. Yet, there are some differences between the two.

- Gauging the SO(N)³ symmetry leaves interesting spectra of operators and eigenstates.
- Energy gaps should become very small already for N=6.
- Higher dimensional generalizations are possible, e.g. a stable sextic scalar theory in 2.8056 < d < 3, which is solvable in the large N limit.
- In 3-ε dimensions it may be studied for finite N using standard perturbation theory.